

Public Document Pack

Planning

Plan/1

Wednesday, 2 October 2024

PLANNING

2 October 2024

10.00 am - 5.50 pm

Present:

Planning Committee Members: Councillors Smart (Chair), Baigent (Vice-Chair), Dryden, Gilderdale, Griffin, Lokhmotova, Thornburrow and Young

Also present Councillors: Divkovic and A. Smith

Officers:

Delivery Manager: Toby Williams

Area Team Leader: Michael Sexton

Planning Compliance Manager: Chris Braybrooke

Principal Planner: Charlotte Burton

Principal Planner (CIP and SCIP Projects): Aaron Coe

Principal Planner: Tom Gray

Senior Planner: Dominic Bush

Senior Planner: Melissa Reynolds

Senior Planning Officer: James Truett

Planning Officer: Grace Cherrington

Legal Adviser: Keith Barber

Committee Manager: James Goddard

Meeting Producer: Sarah Steed

Other Officers Present:

Consultant: Annemarie deBoom

County Council: Harry Pickford

FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE COUNCIL

24/91/Plan Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillor Bennett, Porrer (Councillor Young attended as her Alternate) and Todd-Jones (Councillor Griffin attended as his Alternate).

24/92/Plan Declarations of Interest

Name	Item	Interest
------	------	----------

Councillor Baigent	All	Personal: Member of Cambridge Cycling Campaign.
Councillor Gilderdale	24/95/Plan	Personal and Prejudicial: Had previously raised objections to the application as a Ward Councillor. Withdrew from its determination and did not vote.
Councillor Young	24/96/Plan	Personal: Had general discussion with residents about the application as a Ward Councillor. Discretion unfettered.
Councillor Baigent	24/103/Plan	Personal: Application was in his ward. Discretion unfettered.

24/93/Plan Minutes

The minutes of the meetings held on 4 September 2024 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

24/94/Plan Committee Recording

The Committee minutes list public speakers at Committee. Please view the recording of the meeting on [Cambridge City Council - YouTube](#) to see/hear more detail about statements from public speakers and Ward Councillors.

24/95/Plan 24/01330/FUL Emperor 21 Hills Road

Councillor Gilderdale withdrew from the meeting for this item and did not participate in the discussion or decision making.

The Committee received an application for full planning permission.

The application sought approval for retention of building frontage facade and introduction of a mixed use development comprising basement and ground floor public house and an Office/Business Use (Class E(g)) to the rear and on the upper floors along with access, cycle parking and associated infrastructure following demolition of existing buildings on site.

The Principal Planner updated his report by referring to revised Design and Access Statement text on the amendment sheet.

The Director of The St Paul's Place Company addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application.

Peter McKeown (Applicant's Agent) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Resolved (by 4 votes to 3) to reject the Officer recommendation to approve the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation.

The Committee Adjourned 11:40am to 12 noon so Officers could draft 'minded to refuse' reasons for Committee to discuss and vote upon.

The Delivery Manager outlined five minded to refuse reasons:

1. The proposed development would fail to provide an adaptable and high quality building for future occupants by virtue of the poor and constrained storey heights and the reliance on the basement area that would not have sufficient natural daylight, contrary to Policy 57 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018 [and NPPF 2023].

Reason 1 was **lost by 2 votes to 3 with 2 abstentions.**

2. By virtue of the inappropriate location of the proposed cycle parking facilities within the basement, the proposal would fail to provide accessible cycle parking for all users, contrary to policies 57(d), 80 and 82(a,c) of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018.

Reason 2 was **lost by 3 votes to 3 with 1 abstention – and on the Chair's casting vote).**

3. By reason of insufficient information provided with the application relevant to emergency access and egress, the proposal would fail to

demonstrate safe access/egress for all users in the event of fire, contrary to Policy 57(b) of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018.

Reason 3 was **lost by 0 votes to 3 with 4 abstentions.**

4. By virtue of the loss of garden space associated with the public house, the proposed development would detrimentally affect the future viability of the public house, contrary to Policy 76 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018 [and NPPF 2023].

Reason 4 was **lost by 1 vote to 5 with 1 abstention.**

5. The proposed development would result in less than substantial harm upon the character and appearance of the conservation area, contrary to Policy 61 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018 and Paragraph 208 of the NPPF 2023. The public benefits arising from the scheme in this instance are not considered to outweigh the harm resulting from the development on the Conservation Area.

Reason 5 was **lost by 1 vote to 5 with 1 abstention.**

The Committee:

Resolved (3 votes to 1 with 3 abstentions) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report, and subject to the conditions recommended by the Officer (with delegated authority to Officers to make minor amendments to the conditions as drafted).

24/96/Plan 24/02159/S106A - Land South of Worts Causeway - Newbury Farm

Councillor Lokhmotova left the Committee before this item was considered and did not return.

The Committee received an application for modifications to the Section 106 agreement associated with outline planning permission reference 19/1168/OUT.

The Principal Planner updated his report by referring to updated wording on the amendment sheet relating to paragraph 9.10 of the officer report.

Paul Belton (Applicant's Agent) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 7 votes to 0) to agree the proposed Deed of Variation as set out in the Officer's report and amendment sheet - in consultation with the Council's Principal Planning Lawyer, and any minor changes to the wording to be delegated to officers, including negotiating the terms for the monitoring and administration mitigation for this Deed of Variation.

24/97/Plan 24/01704/S73 - Land South of Worts Causeway - Newbury Farm

The Committee received a Section 73 application to vary condition 3 (Approved plans) of outline planning permission 19/1168/OUT (outline application with all matters reserved in respect of junction arrangements onto Worts Causeway and Babraham Road, for the erection of up to 230 residential dwellings and up to 400m² (GIA) of non-residential floorspace with Use Classes A1/A2/A4/B1/D1, new landscaping and public realm, car and cycle parking, infrastructure, other associated works following the demolition of all existing buildings on the site.

Paul Belton (Applicant's Agent) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 7 votes to 0) to approve application reference 24/01704/S73, subject to:

- i. the conditions and informatives set out below in the Officer's report;
- ii. authority delegated to officers to carry through minor amendments to those conditions and informatives (and include others considered

- appropriate and necessary) prior to the issuing of the planning permission; and
- iii. the prior completion of an Agreement under s106 of proposed Deed of Variation relating to 24/02159/S106A (previous application on the agenda).

24/98/Plan 24/01531/REM Land South of Worts Causeway - GB2 - Phase 3

The Committee received a reserved matters application for appearance, landscape, layout and scale for Phase 3 comprising the creation of 150 residential units, community/ commercial spaces, hard and soft landscaping including the creation of a central square and associated works. The related partial discharge of Outline Conditions pursuant to outline approval 19/1168/NMA1.

The Principal Planner updated his report by referring to the amendment sheet:

- i. Removal of the originally recommended conditions 2, 3 and 5. These details are already secured by the following outline planning conditions 42, 57 and 40 as recommended under application reference 24/01704/S73.
- ii. Additional conditions 2 and 3 to secure the M4(2) and M4 (3) homes.
- iii. Additional condition 5 to ensure the cycle stores are provided with green roofs.
- iv. Amendments to the wording of the recommended conditions 5, 7 and 12.

Paul Belton (Applicant's Agent) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Councillor Baigent proposed an amendment to the Officer's recommendation encouraging electric charging points in cycle stores, and appropriate fire safety provision.

This amendment was **carried by 7 votes to 0**.

Councillor Thornburrow proposed amendments to the Officer's recommendation:

- i. Condition 6 trigger point to be above ground;
- ii. Condition 8 provision of benches in play areas not open spaces;
- iii. Informatives included on the planning permission in respect of:
 - a. encouraging electric charging points in cycle stores;
 - b. encouraging provision of water butts.

The amendments were **carried by 7 votes to 0.**

The Committee:

Resolved (by 7 votes to 0) to:

- i. approve reserved matters application reference 24/01531/REM subject to the planning conditions and informatives as set out in the Officer's report and amendment sheet, with delegated authority to officers to carry through minor amendments to those conditions, informatives and the completion and approval of the Section 106A deed of variation under application reference 24/02159/S106A prior to the issuing of the planning permission;
- ii. approve/not approve the discharge of the following outline planning conditions (planning application reference 19/1168/NMA1) in so far as they relate to this reserved matters application site according to the recommendations for each condition set out in the table below:

Condition	Recommendation
9. Tree Planting and Landscape Strategy	Approve
11. Residential Space Standards	Approve
12. Surface Water Drainage Strategy	Approve
13. Carbon Reduction Statement	Approve
14. Water Conservation Strategy	Approve
15. Sustainability Statement	Approve
16. BREEAM	Approve
17. Noise Assessment	Approve
18. Commercial Noise	Approve
19. Artificial Lighting Scheme	Not Approved.
20. Ductwork	Approve
29. Ecological Enhancement	Approve
31. Bird Hazard Management Plan	Approve
32. Ecological Design Strategy	Approve

43. EV charging scheme	Not Approved.
51. Travel Plan	Approve

- iii. delegated authority to Officers, in consultation with the Chair, Vice Chair and Spokes, to amend the following:
 - a. Condition 6 trigger point to be above ground;
 - b. Condition 8 provision of benches in play areas not open spaces;
- iv. informatives included on the planning permission in respect of:
 - a. encouraging electric charging points for wheelchairs and bikes in cycle stores; and to encourage fire safety provisions for both;
 - b. encouraging provision of water butts.

24/99/Plan 24/00245/REM 111-113 Queen Ediths Way

The Committee received a reserved matters application for approval of access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale following outline planning ref, 22/01411/OUT (Construction of detached bungalow on land to the rear of 111-113 Queen Edith's Way Cambridge).

A resident of Queen Edith's Way addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application.

Thomas (Joe) Leneghan (Applicant) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Councillor Baigent proposed amendments to the Officer's recommendation:

- i. To amend conditions to remove permitted development rights under class B to cover the roof;
- ii. Including an informative on the planning permission to suggest the Applicant could consider the addition of a sprinkler system in the case of permission being granted. It must also be noted that any permitted dwelling must comply with the relevant building regulations relating to fire safety set out in Approved Document B.

The amendments were **carried by 7 votes to 0.**

The Committee:

Resolved (by 7 votes to 0) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report (with delegated authority to Officers to make minor amendments to the conditions as drafted), subject to:

- i. the planning conditions set out in the Officer's report;
- ii. delegated authority to Officers, in consultation with the Chair, Vice Chair and Spokes, to amend conditions to remove permitted development rights under class B to cover the roof;
- iii. including an informative on the planning permission to suggest the Applicant could consider the addition of a sprinkler system in the case of permission being granted. It must also be noted that any permitted dwelling must comply with the relevant building regulations relating to fire safety set out in Approved Document B.

24/100/Plan24/00961/FUL Darwin Green 1 BDW5 6 Plots 202, 203, 204, 205 and 209

Councillor Dryden left the Committee before this item was considered and did not return.

The Committee received an application for full planning permission.

The application sought approval for a new dwelling (Plot 202) and amendments to plots 202-205 and 209 of Darwin Green 1 parcel BDW5/6.

The Principal Planner updated her report by referring to the amendment sheet.

- i. Further representations had been received from the owner/occupier of 2 Martingale Close regarding materials and paragraph 10.14 of the officer report. Also to reiterate concerns about linear density are represented in paragraph 7.2 - see text amendments.
- ii. Amendment to Condition 17 - Green roof (bin and bike stores).

Three Martingale Close residents addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application. (Written statements read by Committee Manager).

Ray Houghton (Applicant) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Councillor Divkovic (Cambridge City Councillor) addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application and concluded by asking the Committee to refuse the application.

Councillor Thornburrow proposed amendments to the Officer's recommendation:

- i. an additional condition that revised floor plans should be approved which comply with adopted internal space standards relating to double bedrooms (Plots 203, 204 and 205);
- ii. an informative included on the planning permission encouraging the provision of safe electric (bike) charging points.

The amendments were **carried by 6 votes to 0**.

Councillor Thornburrow asked Officers to restrict space for parking vehicles behind the building line on Plot 202 when considering approval of hard and soft landscaping condition.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 5 votes to 1) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report, subject to:

- i. the satisfactory completion of a Unilateral Undertaking to link any planning permission granted for the current application to the Section 106 Agreement for the outline planning permission for the Darwin Green 1 development;
- ii. the planning conditions set out in the Officer's report and amendment sheet;
- iii. delegated authority to Officers, in consultation with the Chair, Vice Chair and Spokes, to draft and include an additional condition revised floor plans should be approved which comply with adopted internal space standards relating to double bedrooms (Plots 203, 204 and 205) ;
- iv. an informative included on the planning permission encouraging the provision of safe electric (bike) charging points.

24/101/PlanRe-Ordering Agenda

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Chair used his discretion to alter the order of the agenda items. However, for ease of the reader, these minutes will follow the order of the published agenda.

Councillor Young left the Committee before the next item was considered and did not return.

24/102/Plan24/02669/FUL 23 The Westering

The Committee received an application for full planning permission.

The application sought approval for a part two, part single storey side and rear extensions, single storey front extension, hip to gable roof extension including rear dormer and change of use from C3 (dwelling) to C4 (HMO) for 6 persons along with bin and cycle storage to the front.

The Senior Planner updated her report by stating the wrong images had been included in the plans pack, but the correct images for this application were available on the planning portal and officer presentation to Committee.

A local resident addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application. (Written statement read by Committee Manager).

The Committee:

Resolved (by 4 votes to 0 with 1 abstention) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report, and subject to the conditions recommended by the Officer (with delegated authority to Officers to make minor amendments to the conditions as drafted).

24/103/Plan24/02473/FUL 232 Mill Road

The Committee received an application for change of use from (dry cleaner) Use Class Sui Generis to (hot food takeaway) Use Class Sui Generis.

Mursal Khawaja (Applicant) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Councillor Anna Smith (Cambridge City Councillor) addressed the Committee speaking in objection to the application.

Councillor Baigent proposed amendments to the Officer's recommendation to include:

- i. A condition to restrict the location of industrial containers on the pavement, so bins would only be put on the pavement on the day of collection.

This amendment was **lost by 2 votes to 3**.

- ii. An informative requesting the Applicant minimise the location of industrial containers on the pavement, so bins would only be put on the pavement on the day of collection.

This amendment was **carried by 5 votes to 0**.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 5 votes to 0) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report, and subject to the conditions recommended by the Officer (with delegated authority to Officers to make minor amendments to the conditions as drafted) including the informative relating to minimising industrial containers/bins on the pavement.

24/104/Plan24/01787/FUL CBC Substation

The Committee received an application for full planning permission.

The application sought approval for erection of substation, transformers, switch rooms, gantry, cable connections and associated infrastructure.

Michael Hendry (Applicant's Agent) addressed the Committee in support of the application.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 5 votes to 0) to grant the application for planning permission in accordance with the Officer recommendation, for the reasons set out in the Officer's report, and subject to the conditions recommended by the Officer (with delegated authority to Officers to make minor amendments to the conditions as drafted).

24/105/PlanAppeals Information

The Committee noted the appeals list.

24/106/PlanCompliance Report Cambridge City Council October 2024

The Committee noted the Officer's report.

The meeting ended at 5.50 pm

CHAIR

This page is intentionally left blank